|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Reviewer 1 Suggestions** | **How Addressed** |
| I was also wondering if there are estimates which suggest how many of these EL students go into teacher education in California. This information will help frame the scope of the problem. | Explain that in a given semester, English learners have comprised approximately 5%-15% of teacher candidates enrolled in courses at the authors’ university; However, because the CSU system does not currently include EL status in demographic information collected on teacher candidates, it is difficult to estimate exactly how many English learners enroll in teacher education programs in the state of California. |
| It would also be interesting to speculate on if this issue is not addressed by teacher educators, the effect it might have on the number of teachers entering the field. In other words, what could be the outcome if other states with high EL populations adopted a policy similar to the one in Arizona? What effect would this have on schools and teacher education programs? | Discuss how actions taken by the Arizona Department of Education to “remove” some EL teachers from the classroom raise important questions about how state or local policies specific to English learner teachers could affect the teacher workforce. Speculate on how similar policies, for example, could discourage individuals from multicultural and multilingual backgrounds from entering the teaching profession and lead to less diversity among teachers. Explain how given that approximately 83 percent of teachers are white and many of them are fluent only in English (U.S. Department of Education, 2009), the prospect of measures leading to an even more homogenous teacher workforce is particularly concerning. |
| I was also expecting this to be mentioned again in the conclusion while also acknowledging the need for this professional development to demonstrate how professors should find and articulate grammatical errors using grammar vocabulary. I say this because I am not convinced many would have the knowledge or skills to be as specific in their feedback to students as in the second paragraph on page 8 demonstrates. Also, aside from the role of the faculty, what role should administrators play in addressing this issue? | Discuss how professors in teacher education could greatly benefit from professional development to learn how to find and articulate grammatical errors using the vocabulary of academic English. Explain how, in informally sharing our work with colleagues, the authors have learned that many professors are not well-versed in using some of the techniques discussed in the article and often feel underprepared to provide academic language support to their English learner teacher candidates. Suggest that administrators in universities could play an important role in helping faculty develop skills in this area by supporting opportunities for professional development in academic language feedback among their teacher education faculty, particularly by allocating necessary time and resources. |
| Several comments inserted in manuscript with suggestions for re-wording, re-phrasing, or clarifying a particular statement/idea. | Followed reviewer’s suggestions on word usage, re-phrasing, and clarifying particular statements/ideas. |